

ADVANCE SOCIAL SCIENCE ARCHIVE JOURNAL
Available Online: https://assajournal.com
Vol. 05 No. 01. Jan-March 2026.Page# 5789-5802
Print ISSN: 3006-2497 Online ISSN: 3006-2500
Platform & Workflow by: Open Journal Systems
https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.21947218

Hussain Bin Mansur Al-Hallaj's Theopathic Experience of Esoteric Spirituality and the Role of *'Ana Al-Haqq'* in Mysticism

Dr. Muhammad Iqbal Shah
Professor of Philosophy, Government Islamia Graduate College, Chiniot
philosophypak@gmail.com
ORCID# 0009-0001-2685-072X
Mahrukh
MS Clinical Psychology, Lahore School of Behavioural Sciences, The University of Lahore, Sargodha Campus. /Working as Clinical Psychologist at Kings Hospital, Sargodha.

ABSTRACT
Al-Hallaj known as the 'Mystic Martyr' of Islam and he is considered 'apex of mystical Union' in Sufism. He occupied such distinguished place due to his esoteric epistemology, spiritual theology and on the basis of his "theopathic locutions" particularly the ecstatic utterance of "Anna al-Haqq" This ecstatic and illuminating exclamation turned into a historical debate much-loved as well as cause of controversial debates. It became the centre of mystical interpretations, theological debates, philosophical discussions and legal controversies. It became turning point and nexus of controversies regarding the questions about the ontological relationship between God and Humanity particularly the premier of the metaphysical perspectives of the doctrines of Wahdat al-Wujūd (Unity of Being) and Wahdat al-Shuhūd (Unity of Witnessing). It highlighted other problems such as Psychology of Mystic Experience, the Ontological Nature of the Universe, Attributes of God, Unity and Plurality of Beings, Human Consciousness, Day of Resurrection etc. The epistemological meanings of al-Hallaj's mystical experience were hailed by some Sufis but for some others including Orthodox and common people it was regarded as blasphemous and subject to 'fatawas' as heretic 'Zindiqi' which led to Al-Hallaj's crusification and miserable death. This research examines the perspectives and meanings of the psychological and ecstatic experience of "Ana al-Ḥaqq", the historical traces and future impacts of the doctrine along-with the metaphysical approaches and political controversies that occurred afterwards and concluding Hallāj's spiritual status in Sufism in the eyes of other Sufis.
Keywords: *Al-Haqq, Ecstasy, Esoteric, Exoteric, Theopathic, Wah'dat al-wa'jood', 'Wah'dat al-Sha'hood'*

I. Introduction

Abu Mughith Al-Husain B. Mansur B. Mahamma Al-Baidawi was born at al-Tur near al-Baida in Fars in 244/858. He was a Persian mystic and theologian. He lived in retirement '*Khalwat*' from 260/873 to 284/798 with a Sufi teacher *Tustri Amr Makki Djunaid.* Then he left them for the purpose of preaching of mysticism and asceticism resembling to the '*Karmatian da'i*' in Khu'ra'san, Ahwaz, Fars, India (Gudjrat) and Turkistan. In 296/908, on his return from Mecca to Baghdad disciples rapidly gathered around him.[1]

His father, who was probably a wool-carder, left *Tur* for the textile region which extended from Tustar to Wasit (on the Tigris).[2] At the age of twelve, he learnt the Quran by heart and became

Hafiz. For the purpose of learning the inner meanings of the suras of the Quran he became learner of *tasawwuf* at the Sahl al Tustari. Afterwards he left Tustari for Basra and also got married there. At his first pilgrimage he vowed to remain one year in the sanctuary courtyard in such a state of being with fasting and silence. He wished to have personal way to union with God.[3]

He made his second pilgrimage with his almost four hundred disciples to Mecca where he by some ones was accused of magic and sorcery and having pact with the *jinns.* After that he set for Turkestan and India. In 290/902 he returned to Mecca for third pilgrimage. At the station of Arafat, his prayer was that "God should reduce him to nothing. He should make him despised and rejected so that God alone might grant grace to Himself through the heart and the lips of His servant." After his return he settled with his family at Baghdad. In the streets it was heard that in the burning fire of love to God he proclaimed, "O Muslims, save me from God" . . . "God has made my blood lawful to you: kill me" . . . His desire was to be "to die accursed for his community". Such exclamations aroused anger, discomfort and anxiety among the masses. The Zahirl Muhammad b. Dawud was angry; he denounced him at the court and demanded that he should be condemned to death. But the Shafi'i jurist Ibn Suraydj advocated that mystic inspirations and exclamations were beyond the jurisdiction of the courts.

He was a mystic also poet and wrote a 'Dee'wan'.[4] His poetry was highly appreciated at his time. Miracles were also ascribed to him but some alleged him to be a wizard. He had been suspecting of being a member of a secret organization of being a head of any of them. He was involved in stirring up a revolt against the civil authorities or indoctrination of people in a movement. The authorities found some document in the house of al-Hallaj's disciple which exhibited such instructions that what to teach, how to lead people stage by stage, how to contact people keeping in mind their level of intelligence and faculty of receptiveness.[5]

Thus, he faced a trial for the charge of heresy by Ulemas and conspiracy from the government. The charge of heresy was due to his utterance that he was Reality, i.e. for identifying himself (and everyone else) with God.[6]or as interpreted atht "I am Reality", i.e., the sole reality God. He taught that man is essentially divine, created by God in his own image. God incarnates himself not only in Adam and Jesus, but in every man. His self-deification was repudiated by other Sufis.[7] He was accused by *Mu'tazila* as being charlatan, by a *tawki* of the *Imamiya* he was excommunicated and he faced a fatwa of a *Zahiria* and he was arrested two times by the Abbasid police.[8] The political charge was that he was suspected to be or he has relation with the Kramiteen who were considered as threat to government.

Known as 'Al-Hallaj or 'Hallaj al Asrar'

Al-Husain B. Mansur is publicly known as Al- Hallaj due to the reason His father was a " wool/cotton- carder" *(hallaj)* who emigrates with him, moving about the textile centres of Ahwaz and Tustar (whose imperial Dar al-Tiraz, weaves the annual *kiswa* for the Ka'ba), Nahr Tira, Qurqub, and right into the middle of Arab country, to Wasit.[9]

But later he got fame as Hallaj al Asrar' "the carder of consciences"[10] the cause of that name was he travelled for many years throughout Persia, Turkestan, India and to the borders of China and met his co-religious. Due to propagandized religious activities and the mystic esoteric teachings, he came to be known as "*Hallaj al-Asrar"* the Carder of hearts and conscience.[11] The short form al-*Hallaj* (Hallaj that means to card or to disentangle, by combing the fibre of wool, cotton *etc*) was famous among people.

Personality:

His being was seen as enigmatic, some called him a saint, and a model of esoteric realization, but for some people he was a mystery and ambiguous to be considered a saint. His miracles were viewed as theatrical, staged for to impress people or sorcery or hypnotism.

Al Hallaj started as a disciple in Sufism of Sahl at-Tustari later he left him for al-Makki. Afterwards he tried to enter the circle of al-Junyd al-Baghdadi, who refused him by saying that 'I do not accept madman'. Al-Hallaj said "the (mystical) degree is a gift and not something to be acquired".[12]

Veneration

There were testimonial reports that Hallaj himself and member of his family also encouraged veneration for al Hallaj to the threshold of worship. He said "God is in heavens" "but He is also on earth".[13] There were many who did not follow him and considered him a conjurer but those who follow him had great respect for him. His influence was not restricted to the common people but his followers occupied high government positions and they were even in the court.

Punishments and Charges

For his suspicious activities like propagation of dubious doctrines, he was arrested in 301/913 and placed in jail for many years. After the trial he was charged and condemned for heresy even by the civilians and religious authorities and exoteric.

Nature of His Writing,

About the nature his writing, it is said that he "wrote brilliantly, theologically, allegorically and in juridical formulation. The nature of his mystical exclamations is like novices, some of them are more powerful and some are just acceptable while some are remaining more improper. When a vision is granted by God to man then afterwards the man tries to put that experience (mystic experience)[14] into words which he versioned in the heights of ecstatic power. His words naturally become obscure. They become more obscure if they are expressed in hast and tinged with self-admiration.[15] So were the writings and exclamations of al-Hallaj having ambiguity and esoteric tones.

As Massignon (1986) pointed out, Hallaj figures as a precursor of Ghazali in his endeavor to bring dogma into harmony with Greek philosophy on the basis of mystic experience.[16]

'Exoterism' and 'Esoterism': The two types of knowledge

The term 'Exoterism'[17] signifies the domain of ritual, of moral precepts, of institutions while the term 'Esoterism'[18] stands for transcendent wisdom and mystical union of realization through direct knowledge of the Divine.

'Esoteric' is a Greek term to denote such doctrines which in ancient mysteries were explained to those who had initiated. Those who had not been initiated might be made acquainted with which were termed as exoteric. The term is frequently used in Buddhism and its 'theosophic derivatives'.[19]

Islam described the 'exoteric' and 'esoteric' aspects by the terms '*Shari'ah'* (the religious law) and '*Tariqa'* (the path of mystical realization) or by *az-Zahir* (the outer) and *al-batin* (the inner) respectively. 'Esoterism' is also called the "kernel" (al-lubb) and the Quran sometimes addresses itself to "those who possess the kernel" (ulu-l-albab).[20]

Al Hujwiri said: "The exoteric aspect of truth without esoteric is hypocrisy. The esoteric without exoteric is heresy". So, with regard to the law, mere formality is defective, while mere spirituality is vain.[21]

Proclamations of Spiritual Ecstasy in Public

Socrates was seen in the streets in making inquiries and asking question and searching for answers. But in contrast Al-Hallaj was found very often in making exclamation in the state of ecstasy.

People often found him in a condition of intimate conversation with God in being exalted term:

"O Thou Whose Closeness girds my very skin". Whoever heard such utterance and spiritual proclamations never restrained them to hide from these declarations. Once, in public Al-Hallaj uttered:

"O Man, save me from God for he has ravished me from my self and does not return me to myself. Woe to him who finds himself bereft after such a Presence and abandoned after such union" Hearing such exclamations people started weeping with tears but seeing people crying he started laughing.

"I have renounced faith in God, this reunion is obligatory for me, whereas for any Muslim it is execrable" and *"To claim to know Him is ignorance, to persist in serving Him is disrespect, to stop fighting Him is madness".* He said *"To think that God can mix himself with the human is impiety…and Shirk".* At the background of Al-Hallaj's *Antinomianism* was his particular 'heretical interpretation' of the concept of *'Tawhid'* (the doctrine of the Unity of God) that meant for him that God is completely without any traces of humanity.[22]

An incident had been reported that in Isfahan, Ali ibn Sahl was speaking about wisdom. Al-Hallaj arrived there and said "impudent one, you let yourself talk about wisdom while I am still alive." Consequently, he was chased out of the city as a *'zindiq'* or *'heretic'.* Perhaps "*Hakeem"* is one among the ninety-nine names of God and God is considered as the *"Hakeem"* or *"Aql-e-qul."*

Esoteric Utterance of *"Ana al-Haq"*

Al-Hallaj earned fame by his well-known esoteric exclamation *"Ana al-Haq"* that means *"I am the Absolute" or "The Real" or "The Truth".* He publically said *"I am God".* There are other prefaces of this esoteric utterance *e.g.*

i. Well-known account is that once, on his return from pilgrimage he visits al-Junaud's house and knocked the door, it was asked who was there. He replied "Ana al-Haqq". But the accuracy of this legend cannot be ascertained. But this phrase appeared in an important context of "*Kitab Al- Tawasin*" which he wrote in the last years of his life.[23] And Ruzbihan-i Baqli of Shiraz (d. 1209), was the commentator on the *shathıyat ("theopathic locutions") of al-Hallaj and also other Sufıs.*

ii. *Al-Hallaj in his poetry* once uttered, *"Ana al-Haq".* He announced it to Sufi master Al-Junayd who least impressed by this exclamation simply said "Not So…It is through Al-Haqq that you exit". It was not the case that Al-Junayd denied knowledge of God without other-ness but it was that he defined it just as the elimination of hurdles and obstacles between man and God. In the end of the way, "*Al-abd yabqa-l-abd, wa-r-Rabb yabqa-r-Rabb"* (man remained man while God remained God). Yet man's realization of God was without any limit, without reservation, without any contradiction, and without any type of '*Shirk'* (act of associating any other reality to God) which had arisen from thought and conceptualization itself. Al-Hallaj and his disciples supposed that there was a personal union and the individual was 'divinized'.[24]

iii. It is held that *Ahmad ibn Fatik* said that he had heard from Al-Hallaj "I am the Truth - truth belonged to God- closed with His Essence, there is no difference (between us)."[25] Though this type of 'esoteric exclamation' had given him fame but among the general

masses who were adherents to the simple idea of the Absoluteness of God supported by testimony of the '*Shahatat',* it caused suspicions and questions and became cause of trouble.

iv. Another narration (rawa' yat) is that "One day Hallaj knocked at the door of Junayd's house; he asked 'Who is there?' al-Hallaj replied 'The Truth (Haqq)'. Junayd said, 'Don't say "the Truth,'' but rather say "I come on behalf of the Truth."[26]

v. According to third tradition, he uttered Ana'l-*Haqq* even later, during the trial. Qadi Abu'Umar-b Yusuf asks him, "Who are you?" and he answers, "I am the Truth."[27]

vi. It is said that he was ardently and constantly saying in the preaching manner that proclaiming in solemnity from the high on the gibbet "I am the Truth". That was the 'drum roll' announcing the Sovereign. Harawi regarded it as the "drum roll" announcing the Sovereign. The Turk Nesimi, and the Persian 'Attar said "the gibbet of the *Ana'l-Haqq"* is the *mi'riij* of heroes. When his blood is shed and his ashes scattered, they utter this phrase again, for his vindication.[28] *Ana al-Haqq,* that is to *("I Am the Truth" = "My 'I' Is God"*[29]

vii. Someone may say that, the statement '*Ana'l-Haqq'* is not found in the works of Hallaj.[30] It was actually uttered by him, being in consistency with his teaching where he said expressly in the *Tawas'in* (III, 7) apropos of the Burning Bush in which God said to Moses "I am your God": "And my role *(mathall)* is to represent of this Bush." [31]

viii. In religion, *al-Haqq* is one among the ninety-nine Names of God which is understood as an attribute of God. And it is said that Hallaj's trial occurred and he was punished for having misused this Divine Name. In 'ecstasy' his exclamation of '*Ana'l-Haqq'* was only an effort at usurpation and appropriation. It was a state like that of an ascetic who believes that the radiance of his enthusiasm belongs to him, or like that of a magician who has become haughty with his power.[32]

Psychological Genesis of al-Hallaj the Divine Utterance: '*Ana'l-Haqq'*.

A Turkish Qastamuniyan legend narrated a dialogue between God and Hallaj: God Asked: "Ask me whatever you wish."Hallaj declines. God insists. Hallaj confesses: "I am disgusted with this world, and as for the other life, I will enter Paradise only in order to see You there." God insists again. Hallaj ends by saying, "O my Lord, give me Your personality in my language. "God objects, saying, "This is my treasure; I have faithful servants who punish those who wish to steal it." Hallaj says, "O my just Lord, after You have given me Your personality, they may deal with my life according to Your will." After he says these words, God gives him permission to say *Ana'l-Haqq.*

Al-Hallaj's Esoteric Terminology and Spiritual Meanings

Al-Hallaj's spiritual epistemology consists of some eccentric concepts having esoteric meanings though some of the followings were found in mystic literature yet he approached them very extra ordinarily.

i. ***Ishiq* (Love):** In Sufism, at least two philosophical ideas are traceable to Hallaj.[33]

The first one is the concept of *Ishiq* (Love) as the essential desire… as reported by his follower of Abu al-Hasan al-Daylami (the tenth century) who mentioned it in his book *Kitab atf al-alif al-maluf ala llam al-matuf (*The book of the inclination of the familiar '*alif'* toward the inclined '*lam'*). This very concept adopted by Avicenna (Ibn Sina) termed *Ishaq* (love) as the universal principle of being as well as the animate and inanimate. He viewed God as the *Ma'shuq-e-Awal* (First beloved) Who is Loved, Lover and Love simultaneously,[34]

اصل شہود و شاہد و مشہود ایک ہے
حیراں ہوں پھر مشاہدہ ہے کس حساب میں

this is echo from Al-Hallaj.[35]

Attar a Persian writer in his Tazkirat al-Awliya described that once a saint asked Hallaj: What is Love. He replied: "You will see it today and tomorrow and day after tomorrow." It was reported that Al-Hallaj was dancing in his chains to the gallows and his last utterance was "All that matters for the ecstatic is that the Unique should reduce him to Unity."[36]

جسم خاکی کا جہاں پردہ اٹھا
ہم ہوے وہ میر وہ سب ہمارا ہوا

And when that day he was killed, the next day they burned him, Ghalib said:[37]

نہ ہوئ گر مرے مرنے سے تسلی، نہ سہی
امتحاں اور بھی باقی ہو تو یہ بھی نہ سہی

and the third day they gave his ashes to the wind.[38] Mirza Ghalib aptly said:[39]

اپنی گلی میں مجھ کو نہ کر دفن بعد قتل
میرے پتے سے خلق کو کیوں تیرا گھر ملے

ii. **Divine Union (Identity with God):** This concept is Divine Union, this (*ayn al'jam[40])* means the embodying realization of the essential One-ness or simply the unification of the human spirit with the God. This was said in his theopathic exclaimed locution *"Ana al-Haqq"* that means "I am God". That was the same utterance for which he was martyred.[41]

Schimmel mentions that Mystics occasionally speak of feel as they have the awareness of being fully absorbed into God or even becoming identical to God. Al-Husayn al-Hallaj felt and proclaimed "I am the Real"[42] same condition had been described by Moshe Idel as "She will cleave to the divine intellect, and it will cleave to her. . .. and she and the intellect become one entity, as if somebody pours out a jug of water into a running well, that all becomes one."[43]

iii. ***Tajawuz*** **(hyperbole):** By some Mystics it is believed that Hallaj committed '*tajawuz'*. The mystic term that means a false intellectual perception, simply unreal, a hypocritical pretention, a grave error of a novice. His claim was incriminating sentence but it is excessive; it expressed as intoxication *(sukr),* a rapture *(ghalaba),* a dizziness.[44]

iv. ***Tajali (*****intellectual illumination):** In the state of very high ecstasy, Hallaj intercepted and understood an esoteric Divine secret that must not be revealed on earth. What secret was?[45] The esoteric knowledge of God's Reality and illumination: As Ghalib depicted:

منظور تھی یہ شکل تجلی کو نور کی
قسمت کھلی ترے قد و رخ سے ظہور کی

A-Hallaj was the selected one who was endowed with the esoteric meanings with spiritual illumination as Ghalib said:

گرنی تھی ہم پہ برق تجلی نہ طور پر
دیتے ہیں بادہ ظرف قدح خوار دیکھ کر

v. ***Sirr Wahdat al-Shuhud*** **(the secret of immanence):** The doctrine that the beauty of the world testifies that God appears in every single thing *(shuhud al-mazahir)* even outside ecstasy to the ones who knows how to perceive Him in it.[46] Ghalib said:

جلوے کا تیرے وہ عالم ہے کہ گر کیجیئے خیال
دیدہ دل کو زیارت گاہ حیرانی کرے

Ghalib elaborated and also criticized this:

دہر جُز جلوۂ یکتائ معشوق نہیں
ہم کہاں ہوتے اگر حسن نہ ہوتا خود بیں

اصل شہود و شاہد و مشہود ایک ہے
حیراں ہوں پھر مشاہدہ ہے کس حساب میں

Al-Hallaj holds a special place in the history of tasawwuf specially in the line known as '*wahdat al shuhud'*. Sometimes it is recommended that this should be rendered as the "unity of vision or of look" or as (unity of presence). But the word *"Sudud"* in fact means the 'act of being present at or being a witness of'. But we suggest to keep the meaning of the "unity of witness". The meaning of "*wahdat al-shuhud"* is not only "sight" or "look", but it means an actual presence which *is* total witness e.g. it is God witnessing to Himself in the heart of His votary *(abid).* This union with God *(jam)* guides to an *itti'haa'd* (unification) which is not just a unification of substance but it operates through the act of faith and of love *(ishk or mahabba)* and that welcomes into the emptiness of oneself the Loving Guest (God), "the essence whose Essence is Love", as al-Hallaj stated it.[47] (Though Wahdat al-Wujūd is generally associated with Ibn Arabi, Wahdat al-Shuhūd is most closely associated with Ahmad Sirhindi but al-Hallaj's exclamation possessed the seed of these metaphysical doctrines.)

vi. ***Sirr Wahdat al-Wujiid*** **(the secret of existential monism).** Al-Hallaj was regarded as the foremost representative of *wah'dat al-wujud (*unity of being). According to Massignon, al-Hallaj was anything but a pantheist; rather, he represents the *wah'dat al-shuhud* (unity of witness). The reading of his long prayers will reveal that he tried to circumscribe the eternal and primordial God Who is forever separated by His *Qidam,* his pre-eternal being, from human being, which has been created in time.[48] As Ghalib had articulated:

نہ تھا کچھ تو خدا تھا،کچھ نہ ہوتا تو خدا ہوتا
ڈبویا مجھ کو ہونے نے، نہ ہوتا میں تو کیا ہوتا

The concept that nothing exists but Godo arrive at the logical certitude of impersonal T [49]- identity of every single thing and to proclaim *Ana'l-Haqq,* we must become fully conscious of the Universe, the only means by which God expresses Himself to Himself. 'Hallaj caught a glimpse of that but expressed it before realizing it fully, otherwise the secular arm could not have executed him'.[50]

محرم نہیں ہے تو ہی ، نوا ہائے راز کا
یاں ورنہ جو حجاب ہے، پردہ ہے ساز کا

Though the adversaries of Al-Hallaj classified him among the adepts of existential unity (wah'dat al-wa'jood) yet some claimed that Al-Hallaj had been proved to be a vindicator of cognitive unity (wah'dat al- shu'hood). *Ruzbehan Baqili, Abd al-Qadir Jilani* and *Fakhr Al-Din Farisi* had given adequate explanations in favour of "Doctrine of the Unity". While Jalal al-Din Rumi and other mystics of India like Ali Hamadani, Semnani, Gisudraz, Makhdum Jahaniyan, Bedil and Ahmad Sirhindi considered Al-Halla'j a believer in cognitive unity (Shu'hud'i).[51] In the light of the opinions of such great mystics, no one can distinguish al-Hallaj's thought as strictly belonged to only anyone of the theories. But the reality is that due to the esoterical and allegorical natures of his thoughts, the followers of any of the theory, are able to find their own type of meanings.

vii. ***Sirr al-Muta'*** **(the secret of '*demiurgic investiture'*).** God, Who Himself is immobile, He delegates the 'setting in motion of the universe' to a leader from the hierarchy of saints who must remain hidden. Insofar as the one participates in the Creator's *authorization,* this *muta, the one* has the right to think the *Ana al-Haqq,* the creative word. Ghazali seems to think that after the Prophet, saints like Hallaj could have been invested with

this role. A group of mystics had opinion that 'Hallaj had the duty to say *Ana 'al-Haqq;* he was holy and his judges were unjust'[52] As Meer had pointed out:[53]

کیا جرم تھا کسو پہ نہ معلوم کچھ ہوا
جو میر کشت و خوں کا سزاوار ہو گیا

viii. ***Sirr al-rububiya*** **(the secret of supreme power**). Primarily and essentially, God is the Author of the universe and He is responsible for each personal act in every intelligent being. When this being says freely "I," he divulges the secret; he steals from God; thus, he deserves in this world legal punishment, and after death, damnation. This is what *'Ibis'* Satan and *Fir'own* did and that was what Hallaj did, in saying *Ana'l-Haqq,* the Divine words, stolen from God. Thus, the stealing of truthful and real word, is *kufr* (blasphemy) and forbidden. So did Al-Hallaj thus he is though a saint yet damned. *Ana'l-Haqq* is an explosive sentence, spiritual esoteric secret which destroys the universe in conjuring God to come into it.[54] Al-Hallaj committed to reveal *Sirr al-rububiya* but Ghalib realized the epistemological incompetence in comprehending and uttering the subtlety of the thought and he expressed:

کہہ سکے کون کہ یہ جلوہ گری کس کی ہے؟
پردہ چھوڑا ہے وہ اس نے کہ اٹھائے نہ بنے

ix. ***'Fana'*** **(annihilation).** The personality of al-Hallaj, at the time of the declaration of *Ana'l-Haqq,* was annihilated. This means that a mystic had to admit that the soul is not an accident without duration, but it is a substantial form).[55]

پھرتی ہے اپنے ساتھ لگی متّصل فنا
آبِ رواں سے ہم ہوے نابود ہر جگہ

This is because, demolished by pure Divine Will, which damns the soul for saying "I" through its own mouth.[56]

x. ***Hulul wa It'tiha'd (*Infusion and Union).** *'Hulul'* means infusion of substance, "incarnation", al-Hallaj expressed as "Thy Spirit has mingled itself with my spirit as amber mixes with fragrant musk" *(Diwdn,* M. 41), and besides this he said "We are two spirits fused together *(halalna)* in a single body" *(ibid.,* M. 57). The meanings of this had been misunderstood and the ideal become one among other accusations of al-Hajj's trial. He, in fact intended by *'Hulul'* as intentional complete union (in Love) in which the intelligence and the will of the subject enable him to say "I", all are acted upon by the Divine Grace. As he said "We are two spirits fused together in a single body" As Meer has described it:[57]

جسم خاکی کا جہاں پردہ اٹھا
ہم ہوے وہ میر وہ سب ہمارا ہوا

The objection raised by *Wahdat al Wajudi* Sufi, Ibn Arabi. He said the '*Itehad'* (the unity of beings) should be taken not by "Hulul' but through a total submission of the Divine "I" for the empirical "I". To be "one" with God means to make actual, the divine which in man's spirit has emanated from God. Emanated means that it had not been created *ex nihilio* but it is from the *'amr'* of God.[58]

The personality of Hallaj by the infusion *(hulal)* was transfigured. Firstly, it was like a divine emanation as either one of the celestial Intelligences, the Active Intellect *('aql-e-Fa'aal),* or the Universal Intellect *(aql-e-kulli),* or the Universal Soul *(nafs-e-kulllya),* according to the Qarmathians and Ibn Masarra; it is only indirectly, through this emanation, that God uttered '*Ana al Haqq'* through the mouth of Hallaj. Meer highlighted this:[59]

ناحق ہم مجبوروں پر یہ تہمت ہے مختاری کی
چاہتے ہیں سو آپ کریں ہیں ہم کو عبث بدنام کیا

Secondly, God Himself, by vivifying the heart of al-Hallaj and springing to his lips, through an internal taste, "the way the demon expresses himself through the mouth of the possessed". In either case, the judges who condemned Hallaj were guilty. In both states, the (transfigured) personality of Hallaj lives on, in a state of deifying union *(ittihad)* with God.[60]

In fact, on the one side, the one is the Beloved who allows His lover to play with His own personality while on the other side the lover is the one imprisoned, whipped and his feet and hands get cut off, his blood serve as legal ablution. He is hung and burned and the ashes scattered to the winds. Thus, through this way the lover finds Union with the Beloved. Same was done to Al-Hallaj. Meer narrated this as:[61]

میں نہ گردن کٹائ جب تک میر
عشق کے مجھ سے حق ادا نہ ہوے

xi. *"ifsha e al-sirr": The* Mystical crime of Revealing the Secret

There were many explanations for al-Hallaj's execution. The esoteric Sufı tradition claims that al-Hallaj's death was a punishment for "*ifsha e al-sirr"* (divulging the secret), because it is not permissible in esotericism and Mysticism that a mortal should speak up and say "I am the Creative Truth" or as "*Haqq".* That is against the "law of love", where secrecy is a most important feature.[62]

Abu Bakr Shibli sent a message through Fatima Naysaburiya to al-Hallaj "God gave you access to one of His secrets but because you have made it public, He has made you taste the blade." [63]

خاصاں دی گل عاماں اگے، نہیں مناسب کرنی
مٹھی کھیر پکا کے محمدؐ، کتیاں اگے دھرنی

The sufi Mian Muhaamd Bakhsh explained that it is not appropriate to disclose the esoteric meanings to the ones who do not belong to the discipline of mysticism; They will not understand the spiritual symbolism. It is like to make a sweet dish and put it before dog, for the animals everything is a food and they have no difference between a sweet dish or the grass or meet. In fact, they will prefer to eat grass ofr meet. But Al-Hallaj commits this very sin and he was punished for his crime of 'revealing the secret'.

Esoteric Doctrines of Al-Halla'jiya:

Hallaj became 'hafiz' at the school at Wasit. He willed to "interiorized" the Quran and wished that his *"bismillah"* might become *"Kun"* that meant "his invocation of the God the name of God might unite him with the God's creative will". So, he set on his mystic quest. He, at the event of *Yaum Arafat* on his last Hajj, dedicated himself as a substitute for *the 'Zabihah'* (like the faith of the *Shia* who thought that Martyr of Karbala as *'Zbihah e Azam'*). At his return to Baghdad, He started talking in the streets in an extra ordinary way. He expressed his wish to be sacrificed by Law for the sake of the Law *(kunu antum mujahidun, wa ana shahid).* A fatwa was issued by *ibn Dawud* against Hallaj for his queer way of proving his love for God for offering his life. But another lawyer *ibn Suraij* advocated in favour of him and pleaded that mystical utterances were not to be judged on judicial grounds. But for his other mysterious and spiritual *"theopathic locutions"* and eschatological utterances including the *"Anna Al-Haqq"* considered blasphemy, he was arrested in 301/ 913. But trial was suspended and he was kept in a prison for eight years and eight months.

a. **The symbolic interpretation of Ka'bah:** His trial was started again on two charges: firstly, that he as an agent shared some creeds with the Qarmatian. Though his objective was on spiritual grounds but the government took it on political basis. The second charge was he, in accordance with the *Qarmatians* rebels advocated the *'Destruction of Ka'bah and Makkeh'*. It was reported as true that when he was in Makkah wrote to his disciple Shakir *"Destroy your Ka'bah".* The meanings were not

intended as literal but they were *theopathic locutions* in esoteric language and had spiritual meanings expressed allegorically.

The same allegorical meanings had been expressed by Hazrat Bullhay Shah:

مسجد ڈھا دے، مندر ڈھا دے
ڈھا دے جو کجھ ڈھیندا
پر اک بندے دا دل نہ ڈھاویں،
رب دلاں وچ رہیندا

This piece of poetry by Hazrat Baba Bulleh Shah (1680–1757) did not mean literally to destroy the Ka'bah but it was symbolic language and had spiritual meanings in the same way as Al-Hallaj had expressed his esoteric meanings in his utterances. As Ghalib has defined:

ہے پرے سرحد ادراک سے اپنا مسجود
قبلے کو اہلِ نظر قبلہ نما کہتے ہیں

But the jurists took all utterances in literal sense and did not understand the spiritual meanings or symbolical allusions.[64] As Ghalib had said:

یا رب وہ سمجھے ہیں، نہ سمجھیں گے مری بات
دے اور دل ان کو، جو نہ دے مجھ کو زباں اور

Thus Al-Hallaj was condemned to death and crucified (*maslub*). As decreed in the Holy Quarn:[65]

أَجْمَعِينَ لَأُصَلِّبَنَّكُمْ ثُمَّ خِلَٰفٍ مِّنْ وَأَرْجُلَكُم أَيْدِيَكُمْ لَأُقَطِّعَنَّ

b. ***Iskat al-Wasa-it*.**

This Arabic term had been used in Islamic mysticism this means "the dropping or removal of intermediaries". It refers also to the spiritual practice of bypassing external aids, worldly distractions, and even religious rituals in order to establish a direct, uninterrupted connection with God. In the sphere of *Fika of* Al-Hallaji'an they thought *that* the five *fra'aiz* might be replaced by other works.[66] But it was unfaithfulness for common people who regarded the five *fra'aiz* as essential components of Muslim faith and leaving them meant 'kufr' and unfaithfulness to God.

c. ***Hu'lul al-La'hut fil-Na'sut*.** In the field of *Kalam: God's* transcendence *(tanzih)* above the limits of creation *(tul,ard);* the existence of an uncreated Divine spirit *(ruh natika)* which becomes united with the created (*ruh)* spirit of the ascetic (*hulul al-lahut fi l-nasut*); the saint (wali) becomes the living and personal witness of God (*huwa huwa*), whence the saying: *Ana l Hakh "I am Created Truth.[67]*

d. **Na'sut** (humanity) and **La'hut** (divinity): It said that al-Hallaj tried to live in accordance with the Quranic account of Jesus. In support of this it is said that he used the Christian theological terms such as: Na'sut (humanity) and La'hut (divinity) in speaking of God. This led to think some scholars not only in the East but also in the West to believe that he was a crypto-Christian. His death on the gallows, as on the cross, would fit well into this description.[68]

e. ***ain al- djam*:** In the domain of taswwuf , Hallaj'ian wished the perfect union with the Divine will (*ain al- djam*) through desire of and submission to suffering.[69] As Ghalib said:

زمانہ سخت کم آزار ہے بہ جانِ اسدؔ
وگر نہ ہم تو توقّع زیادہ رکھتے ہیں

Charges of 'Takfir' and 'Zindiq'.

Hallaj was the person who brought Sufism as a social force to the political plane. He gave it an original theological and philosophical superstructure. But this made him vulnerable and exposed to theological charges *of takflr* and he was even threatened by effective legal penalties.[70] The allegation *of kufr* (impiety) is charged at two positions: firstly, 'juhud', avowed denial of the Law, and secondly, *nifaq,* (hypocrisy) with respect to it. Avowed denial has to do with the apostate, *murtadd,* or the obstinate. This can make anyone liable to the *hudud* and to legal punishments provided for it in the Qur'an.[71]

The spiritual rebellion was the worst crime in a religious society. It was known as *Zandaqa*. This word is Iranian origin and it was regarded as one among the thirty deadly sins. [72] *Zindiq* means "the one who makes a (personal) allusion to divine Unity. Hallaj fully knew that by entering into ecstasy through contemplation the subject proves that the legal duty of *tawhid* manifests itself to him but people know it as *zandaqa* which in realty means affirming one's own person in duality with God. But in fact, it is out of the depths of the mystic's ordinary self, that the *(shahid al-qidam)* the Eternal Witness or the Spirit of God, utters the theopathic locution. Hallaj believed that such theopathic utterance would cause to commits us to death, because it sacrifices us in order to resurrect us.[73]

Political Scenario

On political scenario, the Qarmatian revolt was underway, in the North Africa there was rising of *the Fatimids*, thus the authorities were at alarm by seeing the use of religion for political insurrection and subversion. The other critical issue was that the public order was at stake by the cloaked organizations whose objectives were beyond spiritual contemplations.

Al-Hallaj's life, teachings and circumstances of his death throws light on the crucial period of Muslim political history, attitudes towards mysticism, poetry, theology, philosophy and culture. His death marked the turning point in the history of Tasw'wof, Mysticism and Sufism.[74]

Death Stage and Circumstances

The government instructions were "give him a thousand lashes; if he dies from them, chop off his head, and preserve it when you order his body burned; if not, stop the flagellation (after the thousandth blow), cut off one of his hands, then a foot, then the other hand and the other foot; and, once the trunk is burned, display his head on the bridge." Moreover, "And even if he says to you: I am going to make the Euphrates flow with gold and silver for you, don't listen to him, don't answer him, don't interrupt his punishment."[75]

Other narration is: "gives him a thousand lashes, cuts off his hands and feet alternately, chops off his head, burns his body, and scatters his ashes into the water of the Tigris."[76]

The scene was described as: "They brought him before the gibbet and beheaded him. Then his body was rolled up in a mat made of reed strips that they soaked in oil and burned. Afterwards they carried his ashes to Ra's al-Manara for the wind to scatter them.[77] And it was seen that 'before the crucifixion: Hallaj had his hands and feet cut off.[78]

The death stage was narrated as: Then his head was cut off; his torso was left there for two hours during the day; and his head (displayed) in the midst of his amputated hands and feet spoke in a language only the end of which could be understood: *"Ahad, Ahad":* "o Only One, Only One." Then I came near him and I saw that the blood which was spilled had written on the ground: *"Allah, Allah"* in eighty-four spots, the number of false witnesses. After that, he was set afire[79]. Mirza Ghalib said:

جان دی، دی ہوئ اسی کی تھی
حق تو یوں ہے کہ حق ادا نہ ہوا

He spent eight years in prison in Baghdad. He was brought to the wazir Ibn Isa and he was put on the pillory in 301/913. On Tuesday 24th Dhul'qad309/ 26th March 922, on the esplanade of the new prison of Baghdad (on the right bank of the river) opposite the Bab al-Tak, al-Halladj was flogged, mutilated, exposed on a gibbet (maslub) and finally decapitated and burned.[80]

ہستی ہماری اپنی فنا پر دلیل ہے
یاں تک مٹے کہ آپ ہم اپنی قسم ہوئے

He died on (24 Dhual-Qadah 309) March 26, 922. The people in Baghdad even after many decades, were still seen waiting for his return at the banks of the Tigris, on whose waves his ashes had formed the words "*Ana al-Haqq"*[81]

Bipolar opinions about Al Hallaj

By the Sufis, Al-Hallaj in his lifetimes was regarded as heretic. But after his demise, he was favoured by sayings about him as the 'Martyr of exoteric incomprehension'. There are two contradictory opinions about the personality of Al-Hallaj hold by Ibn Arabi. In the first account Ibn Arabi said that in a vision he had seen Al-Hallaj as a saint but he also said that he had a vision in which he saw that the Holy Prophet accused Al-Hallaj because al-Hallaj claimed for himself as bigger than He (PBUH), so the Prophet said that it was right that al-Hallaj was condemned by law[82].

Abu Bakr Muhammad al-Kalabadhi (died 990) wrote pioneering Kitab *al-ta'arruf li-madhhab ahl al-tasawwuf* (Introduction to the creed of the Sufis) where he avoided to mention al-Hallaj who was still considered a 'heretic' by the jurists.[83]

On the other side, al-Hallaj is known as "the martyr of mystical love" and he is regarded as a symbol of 'Mystical Union' and of suffering in love.

Al-Hallaj's crusification had been viewed as the "mi'raaj of saint-ship" by Sunni Sufi. His death was acknowledged as "seal of a most saintly vocation". Sufis adopted al-Hallaj's creeds in their even exoterical books and they have his name in their esoterical '*isnad'. Farid al-Din* distinguished the death of Al-Hallaj as the "apex of Sufism."[84]

Al-Hallaj's Thoughts Afterwards His Death

The martyr's death could not hind his thoughts to flourish. Even without quoting his name, his quotes were among Sufis. The revival of his thought took place particularly in the twelfth century. Ruzbihan-i-Baqlı continued the tradition in Shiraz and in northern Iran Attar initiated into Sufism with the spirit of Al-Hallaj. Attar in his *Tazkirat al Awliya* had given good description of Al-Hallj's daring Love and willingness for bearing sufferings. Name of Mansur b. Hallaj and his teachings are familiar not only to that area where he before his death visit but also in the India etc.

Allma Muhammad Iqbal's tribute to Al-Hallaj

In India, Allma Muhammad Iqbal was the first to rediscover the 'dynamic Teachings' of Al-Hallaj. He praised him in his '*Javednama*' as a kind of forerunner of himself, '*Who brought resurrection to the spiritual dead'*[85] Iqbal mentioned many times the name of Al-Hallaj as Nawa-e-Hallaj[86] in his *javed Nama* as well as the concept of *Twa Sin*[87] under titles: *Twa Sin-e-Gutm, Twa Sin-e-Zr'tsht, Twa Sin-e-Masia, Twa Sin-e-Muhammad.*

After al-Hallaj's execution and martyrdom, his disciples dispersed, split up and hide themselves or they changed into the *Tarika* (religious fraternity). But legal persecutions continued resultantly some followers of al-Hallaj were beheaded in Baghdad between 311-2/ 924-5.[88]That was what Ghalib had mourned:

منصب شیفتگی کے کوئ قابل نہ رہا
ہوئ معزولی انداز و ادا میرے بعد

Notes and References

[1] H.A.R. Gibb and J.H. Karamerst. *Shorter Encyclopaedia of Islam*. (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1961),127-28.
[2] J. Schacht, et al. *The Encyclopaedia of Islam (New Edition).* Vol. 3. (London: Luzac & Co., 1986), 100.
[3] Ibid.,
[4] Dee'wan Al Hallaj available in Arabic Text
[5] Cyril Glasse. *The Concise Encyclopaedia of Islam* (London: Stacey International, 1989), 144.
[6] E Royston Pike. *Encyclopaedia Of Religion And Religions* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd., 1951), 171
[7] Vergilius Ferm. *An Encyclopedia of Religion* (New York: The Philosophical Library, 1945), 320.
[8] H.A.R. Gibb, 28.
[9] Massignon, Louis. *The Passion of Al-Hallaj, Mystic and Martyr of Islam (The Life of Al-Hallaj).* Translated by Herbert Mason. Vol. 1. 4 vols. (Paris: Princeton University Press, 1975), 21.
[10] J. Schacht, et al. 100.
[11] Cyril Glasse. 144.
[12] Ibid., 144.
[13] Ibid., 144.
[14] Muhammad Iqbal Shah *et al*, "The Psychological Gnosticism of Mystic Experience: A Critical Evaluation of A Mystic (Al-Qush'ayri), A Psychologist (W. James) and A Philosopher (M. Iqbal)." *Al-Qamar,* Volume 7, Issue 3 (2024 July-September):65-86.
https://www.alqamarjournal.com/index.php/alqamar/article/view/1512/112
[15] Cyril Glasse. *The Concise Encyclopaedia,* 146.
[16] Donald M, Borchert, ed. *Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Vol. 9. 10 vols. (London: Macmillan Reference, 2006), 303.
[17] Exoteric: (Greek- *Exotero: ex*- outside) of the outside world. External, Understood by the public)
The Winston Dictionary Encyclopedic Edition (Chicago: The John C. Winston Company, 1946), 340.
[18] Esoteric (Greek- *Esotero: eso*: within) taught or understood by, only a selected circle, profound, said of doctrines and beliefs, confidential.
The Winston Dictionary, 331.
[19] E Royston Pike. *Encyclopaedia Of Religion And Religions* (London: George Allen & Unwin Ltd., 1951), 145.
[20] Cyril Glasse. 9.
[21] al-Hujwiri, Ali Bin Uthman Al-Jullabi. *The Kashf Al-Mahjub.* Translated by Reynold A. Nicholson. (London: Luzac & Co., 1911), 14 .
[22] Cyril Glasse. 146.
[23] Lindsay Jones. ed. Encyclopedia of Religion. 2. Vol. 6. 14 vols (New York: Macmillan Reference, 2005), 3756.
[24] Cyril Glasse. 146.
[25] Ibid., 146.
[26] Massignon, Louis. *The Passion of Al-Hallaj, Mystic and Martyr of Islam (The Life of Al-Hallaj).* Translated by Herbert Mason. Vol. 1. 4 vols. (Paris: Princeton University Press, 1975), 127.
[27] Massignon, Louis. 128.
[28] Ibid., 128.
[29] Ibid., 126.
[30] Ibid., 129.
[31] Al-Hallaj, Abu Al- Mughith Husayn Ibn Mansur. *Kitab al Tawasin* . Translated by Louis Massignon (French) Butler Mason (English) (Digital book, 2019), 59 .
[32] Massignon, Louis. 129.
[33] Donald M, Borchert, ed. *Encyclopedia of Philosophy*. Vol. 9. 10 vols. (London: Macmillan Reference, 2006), 303.
[34] Massignon, Louis. 131.
[35] Donald M, Borchert, 303.
[36] Meer Taqi Meer. *Kulyat e Meer* (Urdu). (Lahore: Sang-e-Meel Publications, 1999), 377.
[37] Miraza Asad Ullah Khan Ghalib, *Deewan* (urdu),
[38] Ibid.,
[39] Ibid.,
[40] It means the spiritual station in the "Absolute Union". This is the place where a mystic perceives 'God as the ultimate doer' of all actions. It is gazing at reality strictly through the Divine Presence. Google.

[41] Donald M, Borchert, 303.
[42] Annemarie Schimmel. *Mystical Dimensions of Islam* (Chapel Hill: The University of North Carolina Press, 1981), 62-76.
[43] Moshe Idel. *Kabbalah: New Perspectives* (London: Yale University Press, 1988), 67.
[44] Massignon, Louis. 130.
[45] Ibid., 131.
[46] Ibid., 131.
[47] J. Schacht, et al. 102.
[48] Lindsay Jones. ed. Encyclopedia of Religion. 2. Vol. 6. 14 vols (New York: Macmillan Reference, 2005), 3757.
[49] Muhammad Iqbal Shah*, et al* . "Theosophical Cosmologies And Iqbal's Contribution: Cosmos As Sentient Entity," *Al-Hikmat,* no. 39 (2019):31-48.
http://pu.edu.pk/images/journal/phill/pdf_files/3_v39_19.pdf
[50] Massignon, Louis. 131.
[51] M M Sharif. *A History of Muslim Philosophy*. Vol. 1. 2 vols. (Karachi: Royal Book Company, 1983), 348.
[52] Massignon, 132.
[53] Meer Taqi Meer. *Kulyat e Meer* (Urdu). (Lahore: Sang-e-Meel Publications, 1999), 630.
[54] Massignon, 132.
[55] Meer Taqi Meer. 433.
[56] Massignon, 132.
[57] Meer Taqi Meer. 377.
[58] J. Schacht, et al.), 102.
[59] Meer Taqi Meer.
[60] Massignon, 133.
[61] Meer. 440.
[62] Lindsay Jones. ed. Encyclopedia of Religion,3756.
[63] Massignon, 610.
[64] M M Sharif. 346-8.
[65] Al-Quran 7:124. "Surely, I will cut off your hands and your feet on opposite sides, then I will crucify you all."
[66] H.A.R. Gibb and J.H. Karamerst. *Shorter Encyclopaedia of Islam*. (Leiden: E.J. Brill, 1961),128.
[67] H.A.R. Gibb. 128.
[68] Lindsay Jones. 3757.
[69] H.A.R. Gibb. 128.
[70] Massignon, Louis. *The Passion of Al-Hallaj, Mystic and Martyr of Islam (The Life of Al-Hallaj).* Translated by Herbert Mason. Vol. 1. 4 vols. (Paris: Princeton University Press, 1975), 380.
[71] Ibid., 380.
[72] Ibid., 381.
[73] Ibid., 384.
[74] J. Schacht, et al., 99.
[75] Massignon, 558.
[76] Ibid., 558.
[77] Ibid., 607.
[78] Ibid., 608.
[79] Ibid., 617.
[80] H.A.R. Gibb, 127-28.
[81] Lindsay Jones. ed. Encyclopedia of , 3756.
[82] Cyril Glasse. *The Concise Encyclopaedia,* 146.
[83] Donald M, Borchert, 304.
[84] M M Sharif. *A History of Muslim Philosophy*. 348.
[85] Lindsay Jones. ed. Encyclopedia, 3758.
[86] Muhammad Iqbal. *Javed Nama* (Lahore: Iqbal Iqaa'dmi, 1982), 135, 141, 154,155.
[87] Muhammad Iqbal. *Javed Nama* (Lahore: Iqbal Iqaa'dmi, 1982), 48, 51, 55, 58.
[88] J. Schacht, et al. 102.